

3-2014

Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain, edited by Martin V. Clarke (review)

Julian Onderdonk

West Chester University of Pennsylvania, jonderdonk@wcupa.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.wcupa.edu/musichtc_facpub



Part of the [Musicology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Onderdonk, J. (2014). Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain, edited by Martin V. Clarke (review). *Notes*, 70(3), 433-436. Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.wcupa.edu/musichtc_facpub/32

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Visual & Performing Arts at Digital Commons @ West Chester University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Music Theory, History & Composition by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ West Chester University. For more information, please contact wcssler@wcupa.edu.

Prince Albert of Monaco, offer fascinating glimpses of the artist and his creative environment (pp. 30–53). Finally, a bibliography of books and articles that includes Camille Bellaigue, Paul Dukas, and Gabriel Fauré, as well as Ralph Locke and Sabina Teller Ratner herself, plus a list of sixteen reviews of *Samson et Dalila* published during Saint-Saëns's lifetime, offer leads for further reading and help complete a remarkable portrait (pp. 53–54). While less material awaits those researching lesser-known dramatic works, Ratner's thoroughness is quite welcome.

Other kinds of projects may profit from this thematic catalog. For instance, a reader surveying late-nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century ballet would learn that choreographer Mikhail Fokine (perhaps most closely associated with Stravinsky's *L'oiseau de feu* and *Pétrouchka*, as well as Ravel's *Daphnis et Chloé*) created a *pièce d'occasion* based on *Le cygne* from *Le carnaval des animaux* (1887), entitled *La mort du cygne*, that was premiered by the celebrated ballerina Anna Pavlova in Saint Petersburg in 1907, and which she later danced in London (1911) and Paris (1913) (pp. 351–52). These performances thoroughly pleased the composer, who described the performance he saw as “ravissante” in a letter to Madame Jacques Durand (pp. 351–52). A star vehicle, to be sure, its immediacy, emotionality, and brevity would exert a profound influence in the world of ballet in the first decades of the twentieth century, and as late as 1921, its continued popularity astonished the composer, as a letter to Jacques Durand attests (p. 352). And someone studying French incidental music would discover that Saint-Saëns was asked by playwrights Paul Meurice and Auguste Vacquerie to supply orchestral introductions and interludes as well as choruses for their adaptation of Sophocles's *Antigone*. Ratner explains that the composer “tried to

recreate ancient Greek music, as much as possible, relying on the work of [musicologists] Gevaert and Bourgault-Ducoudray,” and we learn that Saint-Saëns drew upon descriptions of music in *The Trojan Women* of Euripides, a hymn by Pindar, and a hymn to Eros found in Athens, among other sources, to fulfill the request (p. 415). The renowned actress Sarah Bernhardt also commissioned Saint-Saëns to provide incidental music for a new production of Racine's *Andromaque* (whose title role she first played in 1873), to be staged in 1903 at the Théâtre Sarah Bernhardt with the orchestra of Édouard Colonne; the composer responded with an overture, plus sixteen preludes and interludes (p. 427). In Cairo at the time of the premiere, Saint-Saëns was able to attend a performance the following summer in Aix-les-Bains that pleased him greatly, and we learn in an excerpt of a long letter to Jacques Durand that he felt it made the production of Racine's play of 1667 “essentiellement moderne,” because, he averred, the interpretation departed from prior French staging tradition and the ancient Greeks did not know such delicate sentiments as it evoked (p. 429). Clearly, this resource can both initiate and further a wide range of projects.

The second volume of *Camille Saint-Saëns, 1835–1921: A Thematic Catalogue of His Complete Works* is an impressive achievement that will spur new exploration of the composer's music, drawing more attention to the rich legacy of French music from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Perhaps the book's only drawback is its steep price, which, in light of its depth of detail and extensive musical illustrations, may be justified, but may deter some. Even so, it should be on the shelves of every library that supports graduate music research.

JAMES WILLIAM SOBASKIE
Mississippi State University

CHURCH MUSIC

Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain. Edited by Martin V. Clarke. (Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain.) Farnham, Surrey, Eng.; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012. [xvii, 262 p. ISBN 9781409409892. \$114.95.] Music examples, illustrations, bibliography, index.

A new title in Ashgate's *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain* series, this publi-

cation lives up to the series' interdisciplinary ambitions by presenting eleven essays

by thirteen authors working in a wide range of fields, including historical musicology, theology, hymnology, English literature, communications media, and church music history. The result is an eclectic collection of essays that explores topics as diverse as the changing repertory of the Anglican choral anthem, the role of British hymnody in the colonization of Madagascar, and the impact of Darwinian thought on nineteenth-century theories about music's spiritual basis. The topics examined and approaches taken are as varied as the authors involved, and while this leads to a certain unsteadiness of method and approach, the richness and novelty of the contributions make the book well worth it. Not that everything here is new. The "relationship between music and theology" may well be a "burgeoning" subject, as the editor Martin Clarke asserts (p. 1), but it is one that has long exercised hymnologists, who are well represented in the book. A number of contributors are, in fact, well-known writers on hymnody and congregational song; their essays trace familiar themes while still offering fresh insights and perspectives. Mel Wilhoit's discussion of American gospel hymnody ably recounts the story of Ira David Sankey and Dwight Lyman Moody's impact on British evangelicalism in the 1870s and 1880s while also examining them within the context of nineteenth-century revivalism in general. He suggests that the general softening of hard-line Calvinism during the period, the shift towards a more reassuring and sentimental theology, had much to do with their success. Martin Clarke's comparison of two early Victorian hymnbooks, one Evangelical, the other Anglo-Catholic, investigates how the two groups positioned themselves in response to the Church of England's growing acceptance of hymn-singing (as opposed to psalm-singing, which had long been permitted) in church services. Evangelicals welcomed new texts and tunes so long as they were scripturally based or personal in tone, while Anglo-Catholics stressed the revival of ancient texts and tunes that reinforced Catholic liturgies and traditions of communal worship. Again, the argument is not exactly new, but it is well presented, and ends with a striking observation about hymns as markers of "theological identity" (p. 34) for each of the different factions of the nineteenth-century

Anglican Church. Similar conclusions inform Ian Bradley's efforts to pin down the "character" of a wide range of hymns and hymntunes, though his expansion of the field of inquiry to include High Church and Broad Church groups as well, breaks down in an overzealous need to prove his case. Each of the four main parties within the Established Church clearly had a unique theological cast, but they overlapped in subtle ways that Bradley's analysis, for all its sensitivity on the subject, sometimes ignores.

Questions of "theological identity" also inform C. Michael Hawn and June Hadden Hobbs's study of hymn texts authored by British and American women, though their injection of feminist criticism puts the discussion onto a different plane altogether. Here, the "personal" imagery of Evangelical hymns, explored in other essays, is linked to the "language of intimacy" and the "poetics of small things" (pp. 61, 69) by which many Victorian women, confined by increasingly strict gender roles, found an outlet for self-expression. The essay explores connections between religious devotion and sexual sublimation, and suggests that the identification of women and the domestic sphere with passion and spirituality—a cliché of nineteenth-century Anglophone culture—was partly a consequence of the popularity of Evangelical hymns. The stimulating argument is unfortunately marred by a whiff of condescension towards previous scholarship, while a concluding section on the tunes associated with these texts lacks clear focus. Still, their vigorous defense of the "sentimental" Victorian hymn on feminist grounds is salutary, and should raise interesting questions for future researchers about the sexual politics of a masculine *twentieth-century* hymnological culture that routinely dismissed this Victorian repertory.

The last two hymnological essays in the book are by scholars not typically associated with the field. Charles Edward McGuire's contribution focuses on the pedagogical methods of Anglican and Nonconformist missionaries who used hymns to inculcate British values among the indigenous populations of Madagascar. Drawing on the work of colonial historians and on his own research on the commercial strategies and practical methodologies of the Tonic Sol-Fa movement, McGuire paints a vivid portrait

of the complex negotiations involved in the linking of two cultures. James Deaville and Katherine Stopa unearth first-hand reportage of the Welsh religious revival of 1904–5, where spontaneous hymn-singing by the laity directly impacted the character and course of religious meetings. Exploring the dynamics of hymn selection and singing style, and placing the revival in the context of Nonconformist resentments towards the Established Church, the authors reveal a rich intersection of politics, religion, performance, and culture. They also make a passionate case for giving the collective improvisation of white Protestant congregations the kind of ethnographic attention that improvisation among black Protestant congregations has long received.

The remaining chapters shift attention away from hymns to examine other musical genres and theological contexts. T. E. Muir offers a wide-ranging overview of musical and liturgical developments in British Catholicism after the Catholic Emancipation Act of 1829. Contrasting the supposedly “fixed” hierarchical relationship between the clergy, choir, and congregation in Catholic worship with the inevitable shifts of emphasis attending the liturgical and doctrinal debates of the period, he gives special attention to the tensions between local innovation and centralized authority. Particularly interesting is the discussion of Ultramontanism, the push to adopt Roman practice and pronouncements, and the way that efforts to research (and justify) a uniform pan-Catholic liturgy exposed rifts in the historical record that ultimately resulted, in England, in the revival of the Sarum rite and Tudor polyphony. Peter Horton studies patterns of text selection in the Anglican anthem from roughly 1790 to 1930 and sees a long-term move away from strict biblical usage. Where composers in the first half of the period drew expressly from the psalms and passages from scripture, composers in the second half were more likely to set metrical hymns, altered or conflated scriptural passages, and even, in a few instances, non-liturgical poems. Though Horton does not explicitly say so, the reasons he gives for the shift—the growing acceptance of “man-made verses” (p. 138) in worship, the expansion of feast days requiring new texts, the emergence of the parish choir and of a publishing indus-

try to meet parish needs—open a window onto the long-term relaxation of Calvinist principles in the mainstream history of the Anglican Church.

Treatment of text also lies at the heart of two essays that focus on the nineteenth-century oratorio. David Brown’s survey of oratorios from Mendelssohn to Elgar relates dramatic moments and musical decisions in specific works to the theological orientation of their librettos. Like Horton, he pays special attention to the mixing of biblical and non-biblical sources in the compilation of these texts. Jeremy Begbie questions the “consolatory” ending of Elgar’s *Dream of Gerontius* by subjecting the vision of purgatory described in John Henry Newman’s original poem to careful theological and textual scrutiny. The uncertainty and anguish that he finds in Newman’s vision meshes well with recent musicological interpretations of the oratorio (expertly summarized here) as a reflection of Elgar’s “modern” existential doubt and pessimistic world-view. But a reluctance to explore Newman’s own reasons for doubt, especially in view of the strong assertion that “purgatory” lacks any real scriptural authority, renders the author’s argument somehow incomplete.

The last essay of the book, by Bennett Zon, pushes the boundaries of discussion into the realm of science and philosophy. His subject is the impact of the Victorian debate about Darwinism and theology on Joseph Goddard (1833–1911), a little-remembered, if still-significant, author of books and articles on music from the 1860s on. In a musical culture largely given over to scientific evolutionary argument, Goddard’s writing was unique in combining that perspective with a theological dimension. Fundamentally drawn to questions of music’s origins, Goddard reworked bits of Darwin, Herbert Spencer, and German idealist writings on music and spiritualism to fashion a highly personal philosophy of music that synthesized many of the crucial intellectual currents of the day.

Zon’s essay is brilliantly done, but its esoteric subject matter, so different from other essays in the book, points up one of the potential pitfalls of a volume of this sort—disparity between its various parts. A multiplicity of authors, and viewpoints, can of course be a strength, and the range of

interpretive angles pursued—historical, literary-critical, feminist, musicological, ethnographic, and of course theological—does indeed make for a rich conversation. But that same diversity also results in an unevenness of tone and detail that occasionally jars. Thus we are presented with an enormously detailed theoretical exegesis of the Catholic Mass (pp. 41–44) but are left wholly uninstructed about the differences between pre- and post-millenarian worldviews that evidently mark a serious divide in the Evangelical experience (pp. 111–12). Very close textual readings of Newman’s *Gerontius* (pp. 198–201) contrast with whistle-stop surveys of oratorio texts spanning fifty years (pp. 181–95), while nineteen of the book’s twenty-three tables can be found in just one of the contributing essays (chapter 8). Even the focus on *British* music and theology feels slightly compromised by the frequent reference to American materials and subjects. While this is clearly justified by the impact in Victorian Britain of Sankey and Moody and of American evangelicalism generally, some of the essays linger on American developments more than may be appropriate for a book about the British experience.

In other ways, however, the book is strongly coherent—not merely in its six essays devoted to different aspects of British hymnody, but also in its exploration of the myriad ways that music and religion interact. The topic is a protean one and this book points the way forward for future scholars to explore this fundamental subject.

JULIAN ONDERDONK
West Chester University

Die Lieder des Evangelischen Gesangbuchs, Band 1: Kirchenjahr und Gottesdienst (EG 1-269). Kommentar zu Entstehung, Text und Musik. By Karl Christian Thust. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2012. [484 p. ISBN 9783761822456. €39.95.] Appendix, glossary, bibliography.

Karl Christian Thust brings a wealth of experience as a pastor, church musician, and scholar to bear in this commentary on hymns of the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch* (Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt,

1995), the principal hymnal used by the Lutheran Church in Germany. Designed as a companion volume for the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch*, *Die Lieder des Evangelischen Gesangbuchs* closely follows both the structure and content of the hymnal. The commentary simply mirrors the numbering of the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch*, making for ease of use as a companion volume to the hymnal.

This first commentary volume covers the first half of the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch*, with hymns for the church year (numbers 1–154, including sections for Advent, Christmas, New Year, Epiphany, Passion, Easter, Ascension, Pentecost, Trinity, special days, penitential days, and the end of the church year) and service music (numbers 155–269, including sections for procession and recession, liturgical songs, word of God, baptism and confirmation, Eucharist, confession, weddings, gathering and sending, and ecumenical songs). This will be followed by a second volume addressing the remaining hymns in the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch*, comprised of biblical songs (numbers 270–315) and other hymns under the title “Faith—Love—Hope” (numbers 316–535).

Die Lieder des Evangelischen Gesangbuchs serves well its stated principal audience of pastors, church musicians, and interested laypersons who are living with the hymns of the *Evangelisches Gesangbuch* week by week. Thust treats each hymn in detail, explaining the hymn’s history, reception, and uses in the liturgy, while providing insightful analyses of poetry, music, and theological content. The volume fulfills well its stated purpose to provide a better understanding and deeper appreciation of the hymns of the church:

Um sie besser verstehen und wertschätzen zu können, bedarf es deshalb theologischer Hintergrundinformationen und hilfreicher Hinweise auf die Zeitumstände der Entstehung, auf Sprache und Melodie, auch wegen des oft problematischen Gebrauchs bekannter Kirchenlieder eines geschärften kritischen Blickes. (p. 7)

Other than a brief foreword, a glossary, and a short bibliography, the bulk of the volume consists of commentary on each hymn individually. Thust’s analyses of both