

9-2010

Studies in English Church Music, 1550-1900.
(Variorum Collected Studies Series, CS926) by
Nicholas Temperley (review)

Julian Onderdonk

West Chester University of Pennsylvania, jonderdonk@wcupa.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.wcupa.edu/musichtc_facpub



Part of the [Musicology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Onderdonk, J. (2010). Studies in English Church Music, 1550-1900. (Variorum Collected Studies Series, CS926) by Nicholas Temperley (review). *Notes, Second Series*, 67(1), 110-112. Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.wcupa.edu/musichtc_facpub/29

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Visual & Performing Arts at Digital Commons @ West Chester University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Music Theory, History & Composition by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ West Chester University. For more information, please contact wressler@wcupa.edu.

and the revelation of its origins as a “symbolic formulation of aristocratic taste” (p. 336) may lead to the lessening of the veneration of pastoral themes that has produced such an abundance of timeless musical works. Instead, this account will enhance the esteem with which we regard the pastoral topic. It may allow for self-reflective analysis into the role the pastoral topic plays in our contemporary society, and speculation as to whether its role today is analogous to that of its origin. In the meantime, we can assert that the “Myth of Arcadia” continues to inspire composers and performers, and now scholars as well.

BIBIANA GATTOZZI
University of Texas, Austin

Studies in English Church Music, 1550–1900. By Nicholas Temperley. (Variorum Collected Studies Series, CS926.) Farnham, UK: Ashgate, 2009. [x, 356 p. ISBN 9780754659983. \$134.95.] Music examples, illustrations, index.

Nicholas Temperley will be familiar to all who have a sneaking affection for neglected British music. Almost singlehandedly, his work on early nineteenth-century keyboard music, and on Victorian opera and concert music in particular, has made this once unfashionable repertory a source of growing research by British and American scholars. (From 2003 to 2006, he was the first president of the North American British Music Studies Association (NABMSA), a thriving organization that is raising the profile of British music studies worldwide.) His interest in the byways of British music reached an early peak with the landmark publication *The Music of the English Parish Church* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979; reprinted 2005). This work focused not on the great cathedral repertory, long the subject of study by British musicologists, but on the neglected music of the English parish church. Psalm and hymn tunes, Anglican chants, choral anthems, organ voluntaries, fuguig tunes—these and related genres were given extensive treatment, their relationship to the Anglican liturgy, formal parallels with art music, and stylistic evolution

over time carefully plumbed and described. Indeed, one of the distinguishing features of the book was the way that Temperley—a former editor of the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* and author of books on Haydn and Chopin, among others—brought the analytical techniques and research skills of mainstream musicology to bear on this “humble” repertory. Statistical, bibliographical, contextual, and stylistic analysis, as well as an unusually detailed focus on performance practice, brought to vivid life the role played by music in the everyday worship of generations of ordinary English men and women.

Similar virtues inform this new publication, which covers some of the same ground as *The Music of the English Parish Church* but in greater detail. A new title in Ashgate’s Variorum Collected Studies Series, *Studies in English Church Music* comprises fourteen essays reprinted from journal articles and specialized book chapters that Temperley has published over the years. It therefore goes into more detail than the earlier survey often could—while covering fewer subjects, of course. Topics touched on briefly in the 1979 book—the Middleburg Psalms, the Anglican communion hymn, the late church music of Sir John Stainer—are here treated in depth, as the author takes us into the archives, explains the larger historical forces impacting specific developments, and shows us his thought-process in the face of ambiguous evidence for reaching the conclusions he does. The essay on the rise in the mid- to late eighteenth century of the Foundling and Magdalen Hospital charities and their hymnbook collections, relatively scantied in the earlier book, is exemplary. It begins with a consideration of the social and intellectual currents prompting the newfound interest in charity organizations at that time, offers a thumbnail history of the Foundling Hospital, proceeds to the dating of the hospital hymnbook collection (consulting bills of sale, publisher’s engraving plates, and related archival material, Temperley convincingly proposes a new date for its first edition), then to a detailed discussion of the music of the collection and of its changing contents in later editions. Here, alterations in repertory and style over time are related to changes in musical personnel, adjustments in the

Charity's marketing strategies, and of course changes in musical taste. The focus then shifts to the Magdalen Hospital and its hymnbooks, where an equally thorough contextual, bibliographical, and stylistic examination points up similarities to but also crucial differences from the Foundling Hospital collection, notably in evangelical tone. The comparison, itself made meaningful by the virtuosic marshaling of various categories of data, sheds light on the many pressures—social, economic, musical, spiritual—affecting eighteenth-century religious life.

This level of detail also illuminates topics that were accorded considerable space in *The Music of the English Parish Church*. John Playford's role in reviving congregational psalmody after the Restoration, the origins of the eighteenth-century Anglican fuguing tune (before its journey to America), the contributions of the amateur Yorkshire musician Jonathan Gray in the revival of congregational psalm chanting in the 1820s and 1830s—these and other subjects enjoyed significant coverage in that book, and yet are engagingly expanded upon here. The discussion of the fuguing tune, in particular, is enlarged to pursue details about the geographic dissemination of these often anonymous compositions, data that the author combines with a more traditional bibliographical and stylistic investigation to create a convincing stemma. An overview of organ settings of English psalm tunes, besides bringing together into a single coherent narrative points scattered throughout the earlier book, extends the story into the twentieth century and offers new suggestions for the relative paucity of this genre in England vis-à-vis Germany and the Netherlands, where it enjoyed great prestige. The answer lies in the peculiar blend of Catholic and Calvinist elements in the Church of England, and the practical need for organist-musicians to cultivate the inherited genres of the well-endowed cathedral tradition at the expense of the more popular forms associated with the cash-strapped parish church. (Freer from Catholic tradition and typically employed by municipally supported town churches, Dutch and German musicians, by contrast, were better placed, temperamentally and economically, to draw on the new Protestant genres.) Here, as elsewhere,

Temperley digs deep into the central themes of the earlier book and imbues them with enhanced life.

The symbiotic relationship between the two books does result in some unnecessary repetition, as when the discussion (pp. 74–76) about Elizabethan folk ballads and the earliest psalm tunes closely approximates material from the earlier book. Likewise, the inclusion of statistical data about organ acquisition by parish churches between 1660 and 1830—data that Temperley freely acknowledges (p. 175) was compiled specifically in preparation to writing *The Music of the English Parish Church*—seems hard to justify except in relation to the earlier book. (Admittedly, one objective of the Variorum series is to make out-of-the-way articles more readily available, but few scholars interested in this level of detail will surely know how to find the essay in its original published location.) Overlap of this sort is minimal, however, and in no way affects the quality of the new book. Indeed, thanks to its careful organization, which divides the fourteen essays into two discrete sections and neatly arranges the essays included within each, *Studies in English Church Music* stands rather convincingly on its own. Part 1, entitled “Vernacular Church Music,” concerns itself with “humble” genres and settings, notably the anonymous tunes of unaccompanied metrical psalmody and its offshoots like the fuguing tune, with special attention given to the folk-like processes of congregational singing and tune dissemination. Part 2, “Artistic Church Music,” focuses on more elaborate genres and settings, involving either organ accompaniment or choral singing, and mostly on music of known authorship. While the two categories are not airtight—fuguing tunes emerged out of the voluntary choirs of the early eighteenth century, while organs accompanied congregational psalmody in wealthier parishes—Temperley keeps a steady eye on the subtleties that make for a distinction between “high” and “low” within parish church music itself. Meanwhile, his method of grouping like essays together within each section—the three interrelated studies of the eighteenth-century charity hymn in part 2 demonstrate this nicely—enriches the discussion immeasurably, and makes the book a model of scholarship that is at once focused and synoptic.

Unfortunately, the physical appearance of the volume lets the quality of its contents down badly. Ashgate's policy for its Variorum series is to reproduce the original articles photographically without resetting them; this means that the various essays each use a different typographical font and format and that two systems of pagination—one for the given article, the other for the overall volume—are in evidence throughout. While this arrangement may please specialized scholars who wish to use the book as a kind of ersatz replica of the original articles, it is awkward and certainly inelegant for more general readers. It also makes for practical difficulties that limit the book's scholarly usefulness. Bibliographical citations make no mention of the fact that the articles they cross-reference can be found elsewhere in the volume. New research and corrections, instead of being assimilated into the text, are relegated to an "Addenda and Corrigenda" section in the back, keyed by means of asterisks that appear, somewhat randomly, in the margins of specific pages. (This impression is not helped by the fact that the relevance of one or two of the addenda to the main body of the text is not immediately clear.) Specific musical works are often referred to *The Hymn Tune Index* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), Temperley's own massive database of English language hymn and psalm tunes whose full integration here would have greatly eased analysis and comparison. As cost-saving measures, these half-solutions are perhaps inevitable, even ingenious. Economic necessity does not, however, excuse Ashgate from providing a very inadequate index nor from failing to introduce inexpensive same-page changes—a footnoted reference to an unexplained conference here, a bibliographical discrepancy there—that would have made for a more unified whole. Particularly galling is that the three essays in the book that *have* been reset by the publisher (for reasons not stated here) generally reproduce the original texts word for word, thereby passing up a golden opportunity to introduce some local improvements at least.

Still, it is good to have these essays—which do after all originate in a wide array of sources—available between two covers. Written between 1972 and 2006, they

demonstrate just how tenacious Temperley's interest in English church music has been throughout his career. It has been a remarkable career, and any book that makes the scholarship more widely available is greatly to be welcomed.

JULIAN ONDERDONK
West Chester University of Pennsylvania

Franco Alfano: Transcending Turandot. By Konrad Dryden. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2010. [xvii, 201 p. ISBN 9780810869707 (hardcover), \$65; ISBN 9780810869776 (paperback), \$40.] Illustrations, work list, bibliography, name index.

Until recently, the lives and works of fin-de-siècle Italian composers have garnered little scholarly attention. The enduring historical narrative of late-nineteenth-century Italian musical decline, the lapsing of most works from the repertory, and the destruction of primary source material during World War II have all helped to discourage musicologists from undertaking study of these composers in the most comprehensive of academic forms, the monograph. Even Puccini, the most enduringly successful of his generation, has received this honor only in the last twenty years, with the volumes of Michele Girardi (*Giacomo Puccini. L'arte internazionale di un musicista italiano* [Venice: Marsilio, 1995]), Julian Budden (*Puccini: His Life and Works* [Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002]), and Alexandra Wilson (*The Puccini Problem: Opera, Nationalism, and Modernity* [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007]), providing stimulating models for approaching Italian fin-de-siècle repertory from analytical, biographical, and cultural perspectives.

A welcome exception to this rule is found in the work of author Konrad Dryden, who during the last decade has produced monographs on the late-nineteenth-century Italian opera composers Riccardo Zandonai (*Riccardo Zandonai: A Biography* [New York: Peter Lang, 1999]) and Ruggero Leoncavallo (*Leoncavallo: Life and Works* [Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2007]), and who now offers a third: a study of Franco Alfano, nowadays best known for